

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

PABLO STAR LTD., *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE WELSH GOVERNMENT, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 15-CV-1167(JPO)

**DEFENDANT TRIBUNE CONTENT AGENCY'S ANSWER TO  
PLAINTIFFS' FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Defendant Tribune Content Agency, LLC ("TCA") hereby answers the First Amended Complaint ("FAC") of Plaintiffs Pablo Star Ltd. ("Pablo Star") and Pablo Star Media Ltd. ("Pablo Media") (collectively, "Plaintiffs"). TCA answers the FAC in paragraphs headed, labeled and numbered to correspond to the FAC in Dkt. No. 26.

**PLAINTIFFS AND THE SUBJECT WORKS**

1. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

2. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

3. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

4. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

5. This paragraph does not contain an allegation to which a response is required.

6. TCA admits the allegations of this paragraph.

7. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

8. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

9. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

10. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph and therefore denies the same.

11. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

#### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

12. TCA admits Plaintiffs purport to bring an action for copyright infringement, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

13. TCA admits this Court has jurisdiction over it, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

#### ***The Welsh Government and Visit Wales***

14. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Court's March 16, 2016 Opinion and Order (the "March 16 Order"), incorporated herein by reference. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

15. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a

response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

16. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

17. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

18. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

19. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

20. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

21. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

22. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

23. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

24. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

25. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

26. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a

response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

27. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

28. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

29. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

30. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

31. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

32. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

33. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

34. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

35. The allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order. Accordingly, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at another defendant, and therefore denies the same.

***The Publisher Defendants***

36. TCA states that all other defendants have been dismissed from this case and this paragraph does not contain an allegation requiring a response.

37. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or the notice of voluntary dismissal filed March 29, 2016 ("Voluntary Dismissal") Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required,

TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

38. TCA admits the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

39. TCA admits that it is subject to personal jurisdiction in this Court, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

40. TCA admits it that, since 2015, it had one employees, who works out of his home, dealing with video content, in New York. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

41. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is

required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

42. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

43. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

44. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

45. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

46. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

47. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

48. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

49. TCA admits the allegations of this paragraph.

50. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

51. TCA admits the allegations of this paragraph.

52. TCA admits the allegations of this paragraph.

53. The allegations of this paragraph are not directed to a specific defendant. TCA is therefore without sufficient information to admit or deny the allegations and denies the same. To the extent that the paragraph refers to TCA, it denies it receives advertising revenue from companies located in New York.

54. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

55. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

56. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

57. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

58. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

59. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

60. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

61. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

62. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

63. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

64. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

65. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

66. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response

is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

67. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

68. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

69. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

70. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

71. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

72. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

73. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

74. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

75. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

76. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

77. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response

is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

78. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

79. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

80. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

81. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

82. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

83. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

84. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

85. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

86. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

87. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

***Jurisdiction***

88. TCA admits Plaintiffs purport to bring an action for copyright infringement, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

89. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

90. TCA admits venue is proper in this Court over it, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

91. TCA admits venue is proper in this Court over it, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

92. TCA admits venue is proper in this Court over it, but denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

**FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

93. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

94. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

95. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

96. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

97. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

98. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

99. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

100. TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph, and therefore denies the same.

101. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

102. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

103. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

104. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

105. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

106. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

**COUNT I**

**COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS**

107. The foregoing responses are incorporated by reference.

108. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

109. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph.

110. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

111. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

112. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is

required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

113. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

114. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

115. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

116. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

117. TCA admits that the FAC purports to seek damages but denies Plaintiffs are entitled to an award of damages. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

118. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

119. TCA admits that the FAC seeks a preliminary and permanent injunction but denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to such relief.. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

120. TCA admits that the FAC seeks an award of attorneys' fees and cost but denies Plaintiffs are entitled to such an award.. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

**COUNT II**

**CONTRIBUTORY AND VICARIOUS COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT AGAINST THE  
WELSH GOVERNMENT**

121. The foregoing responses are incorporated by reference.

122. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

123. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

124. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

125. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

126. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

127. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

128. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

129. TCA denies the allegations of this paragraph directed to it. To the extent the allegations contained in this paragraph relate to claims that have been dismissed pursuant to the March 16 Order and/or Voluntary Dismissal, no response is required. To the extent a response is required, TCA is without sufficient information to admit the allegations of this paragraph to the extent they are directed at other defendants, and therefore denies the same.

#### **DEFENSES**

1. TCA denies any allegation in the FAC not specifically admitted herein.

2. The FAC fails to state facts sufficient to constitute a claim upon which relief can be granted.
3. Plaintiffs lacks standing or capacity to sue concerning the claims advanced.
4. Plaintiffs do not own the entire right, title and interest to the alleged copyrights.
5. To the extent that Plaintiffs purport to rely on an alleged license from Gwen Watkins, such license is invalid as having been procured by duress or fraud.
6. Plaintiffs' claims are barred by the doctrine of fair use.
7. Any use of the alleged copyrights was made pursuant to license and authorized permission.
8. Jeffrey Towns procured the alleged copyrights in the photographs by a sale to him by Gwen Watkins.
9. The alleged copyrights have expired.
10. TCA is not a member, owner or subscriber to the Associated Press.
11. Plaintiffs' claims are barred by claim or issue preclusion.
12. Plaintiffs are barred from recovery by the doctrines of laches, waiver, estoppel, acquiescence, and/or unclean hands.
13. Plaintiffs' claims are barred in that any damage or injury to Plaintiffs was caused by Plaintiffs' own actions and/or conduct.
14. Plaintiffs' claims are barred by assumption of the risk.
15. Plaintiffs are barred from seeking and are not entitled to any equitable or injunctive relief.
16. TCA expressly reserves the right to assert additional defenses as they become known through further investigation and/or discovery.

**RELIEF REQUESTED**

TCA respectfully requests the following relief:

1. judgment in TCA's favor against Plaintiffs;
2. order denying any injunctive relief to Plaintiffs;
3. award of TCA's attorneys' fees, costs and expenses as allowed by law; and
4. such other and further relief as the Court deems just and proper

Dated: March 31, 2016

Respectfully submitted,

Of Counsel:

Kevin M. Bell  
PORZIO, BROMBERG & NEWMAN P.C.  
1200 New Hampshire Ave. NW, Suite 710  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 517-1888

/s/ Richard J. Oparil  
Richard J. Oparil (RO9269)  
Caroline C. Maxwell (*pro hac vice*)  
PORZIO, BROMBERG & NEWMAN P.C.  
1200 New Hampshire Ave. NW, Suite 710  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 517-1888

Attorneys for Defendant  
Tribune Content Agency, LLC

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing was served on all counsel of record on March 31, 2016 through the Court's ECF system.

/s/ Richard J. Oparil  
Richard J. Oparil (RO9269)